



- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

NNA Manuscript Revision Required | BMS-NNA-2019-2

2 messages

Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia <admin@bentham.manuscriptpoint.com>

26 March 2019 at 11:27

Reply-To: Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia <nna@benthamscience.net>

To: wipsarian@uny.ac.id

Cc: rakhshanda@benthamscience.net

Reference#: BMS-NNA-2019-2

Submission Title: Mixing of Graphite with X-ray Irradiated Water Towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers

Dear Dr. Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru,

Thanks for submitting the manuscript to "Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia". Your manuscript has been reviewed by experts in the field, and the consensus is that it needs significant revision keeping in consideration the comments given below. You are encouraged to address the comments of the reviewers and carefully revise the manuscript, indicating the exact changes made in the manuscript. **Publication policy requires the return of your revised manuscript latest within two weeks of the safe receipt of this message.**

Furthermore, please note that Bentham ONLY accepts articles written in good English for publication.

Authors who are not native English speakers, should please ensure to have their article corrected by a native English speaker or by a professional language editor for any grammatical, semantical/stylistic and typographical errors.

Authors who are native English speakers should ensure that their article has been revised for language, grammar, and style (where appropriate). This is in your interest as it will substantially reduce the time taken for publication of your article.

Reviewer's Comments:

Reviewer A:

My comments are as follows:

- 1) In general, the results of this paper are relatively soundness to be published in a journal that focuses on nanoscience but the manuscript suffers from serious ambiguous results.
- 2) The change (or not) on the composition of water after irradiation is not reported or discussed. Authors should clarify that what happened after irradiation of X-RAY which water can oxidize graphite.
- 3) The authors should explain how the water turns into an oxidizing agent by radiation.
- 4) Results of EDAX analysis show the presence of various metals such as silicon and magnesium. Why?
- 5) FT-IR contains CN bond Why? How did nitrogen enter the structure?
- 6) The production process for graphene oxide nanoparticles is uncertain?
- 7) SEM does not show layers. TEM is mandatory.

Reviewer B:

Authors reported the synthesis of graphene oxide using the graphite from Zinc-Carbon (ZnC) battery wastes. The topic is interested to Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia. However, major revision should take place before acceptance taken into account the following point:-

1. X-ray diffraction of the product should be added.
2. TEM image or AFM images should be added.
3. The language is poor and should be rewritten.
4. Infrared spectra (Figure 6) should be revised. I don't think that there are peak for C≡N, peak near to 1500 cm⁻¹ refers to C=O.

Sincerely,

Ambreen Irshad
Senior Editor
Bentham Science Publishers

Attachments:

- **Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc** <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>
To: rhyko irawan w <rhyko.irawan17@gmail.com>

27 March 2019 at 11:02

[Quoted text hidden]

Reminder for Revised Submission | BMS-NNA-2019-2

2 messages

admin@bentham.manuscriptpoint.com <admin@bentham.manuscriptpoint.com>

8 April 2019 at 19:12

Reply-To: nna@benthamscience.net

To: wipsarian@uny.ac.id

Cc: nna@benthamscience.net

Reference#: BMS-NNA-2019-2

Submission Title: Mixing of Graphite with X-ray Irradiated Water Towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers

Dear Dr. Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru,

Just a gentle reminder for revised submission for your submission, for Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia.

Looking forward to receiving the revised version in due course.

Sincerely,

Editorial Office
Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia
Bentham Science Publishers

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

13 April 2019 at 09:19

To: nna@benthamscience.net

Reference#: BMS-NNA-2019-2

Submission Title: Mixing of Graphite with X-ray Irradiated Water Towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers

Dear Editorial Office
Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia
Bentham Science Publishers

Thank you very much for the Email. We apologise for the late reply. We finally have revised the manuscript entitled above. We attached the revised manuscript and the response letter in this email (attachment file).

We hope that the manuscript can be considered accordingly.

Best regards,
Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, PhD
Physics Education Department,
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta

[Quoted text hidden]

2 attachments



Response Letter to the Editor of Nanoscience and Nanotechnology.docx

111K



water radiolysis revised.docx

2988K



- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Revised Copyright Letter NNA (Brams Dwandaru)

1 message

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

14 June 2019 at 10:54

To: Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia <nna@benthamsience.net>, "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Dear Editor of Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA

Rukhshanda Rehman

Assistant Manager Publications

Thank you very much for your email. We have revised the copyright letter as requested. We have registered all authors in the copyright letter. The document is enclosed in this email.

Best Regards,

Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, PhD

Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta



copyright letter NNA Brams.pdf

404K



Gmail



nna@benthamscience.net



1,095

5 of 7

Fwd: 2nd proof NNA-2019-2-Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru

**Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA** <nna@benthamscience.net>

to me

REF. FINAL PI

Dear Dr. Dwandaru,

With reference to your email regarding the proofs corrections. Please find attached the FINAL review, and suggest any corrections that need to be incorporated before its publication or your acceptance of this draft as final proofs within **24** hours. On receipt of your response.

Please make sure that you have returned the **copyright letter** and have sufficiently revised your manuscript (if any).

Looking forward to a prompt response in this regard.

With best wishes,
Ms. Rukhshanda Rehman
Manager Publications
Bentham Science Publishers
Executive Suite Y-2
P.O. Box 7917, Saif Zone
Sharjah, U.A.E.



- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Inquiry of Manuscript (BMS-NNA-2019-2/Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru)

3 messages

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

29 December 2019 at 08:23

To: Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia <nna@benthamscience.net>, admin@bentham.manuscriptpoint.com, qasit@benthamscience.net, rakhshanda@benthamscience.net

Mixing of Graphite with X-Ray Irradiated Water towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers
=====

Dear Editorial of Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia,

Thank you again for considering our manuscript entitled "Mixing of Graphite with X-Ray Irradiated Water towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers" to be published in Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia. This manuscript has been in the 'Article Ahead of Print' box since your last email on the 7th August 2019. Hence, we would like to ask the status of our manuscript:

- a) Is there any requirement that we have missed or did not do that make our manuscript not published yet?
- b) Do we have to make a purchase of the manuscript in order to get it published?
- c) May we know an estimate when the manuscript will be published?

Thank you very much in advance for the explanation. I apologize for the inconvenience.

Best regards,
Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, PhD
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta

Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA <nna@benthamscience.net>

30 December 2019 at 18:57

To: "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Dwandaru,

This is with reference to your manuscript entitled "**Mixing of Graphite with X-Ray Irradiated Water towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers**", submitted for publication in journal "Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia (NNA)". Your manuscript had been published on the journal's website with DOI no. 10.2174/2210681209666190617093904. Please find below the response to your queries:

- 1- Your manuscript has been line up in the upcoming issues of the journal and will be published by 2020.
- 2- There are no publication charges in the journal. The manuscript will be published free of cost.
- 3- Your manuscript will be published in 2020 issue and the issue and volume no. will be assigned at the time of issue finalization.

Anticipating your understanding in this regard.

We wish you a Very Happy New year.

Thanks & regards,

Rukhshanda Rehman

Assistant Manager Publications

Note:

Please reply to this email at nna@benthamscience.net otherwise your email will not reach me

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

Untuk mendukung “Gerakan UNY Hijau”, disarankan tidak mencetak email ini dan lampirannya.
(To support the “Green UNY movement”, it is recommended not to print the contents of this email and its
attachments)

Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
www.uny.ac.id

- **Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc** <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>
To: Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA <nna@benthamscience.net>

31 December 2019 at 11:07

Dear Editorial Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA,
Rukhshanda Rehman

Thank you very much for clarifying the status of our manuscript.

We look forward to the upcoming issue of our manuscript.

We wish the best for the Editorial Team and we again apologize for the inconvenience.

Best regards.

Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, PhD
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta

[Quoted text hidden]



- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Manuscript Acceptance letter | BMS-NNA-2019-2

8 messages

Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia <admin@bentham.manuscriptpoint.com>

2 June 2019 at 12:42

Reply-To: Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia <nna@benthamscience.net>

To: wipsarian@uny.ac.id

Cc: nna@benthamscience.net, qasit@benthamscience.net, rakhshanda@benthamscience.net

Reference#: BMS-NNA-2019-2

Submission Title: Mixing of Graphite with X-ray Irradiated Water Towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers

Dear Dr. Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru,

I am pleased to inform you that your article entitled "**Mixing of Graphite with X-ray Irradiated Water Towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers**" has been accepted for publication in "**Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia**" after independent peer review.

We recommend you to publish your **Animated Abstract**, along with the article abstract, to extend the coverage of your article. Bentham Science has collaborated with Focus Medica, one of the world's largest publishers of expert animated atlases and videos in medicine and science, to create an **Animated Abstract** of your article. **Animated Abstract** will be published as open access (free-to-view) and help summarise the essential discoveries/key findings of your research, highlight the importance of the article for further research and utilization in the relevant industry. Each professionally produced, full-coloured animated abstract, in video format (length 3 – 5 minutes) is accompanied by an english or foreign language commentary. You can avail this service against a fee to get the **Animated Abstract** published with your textual / graphical abstract on the Journal's homepage (for reference, please visit: <http://www.eurekaselect.com/video.html>).

It will serve to define and gain attention for the article. For more information, please view the 'Instructions for Authors'.

Please note the figures provided in color will be published against payment. For further details, please refer to the Instruction for Authors.

You may wish to request your Librarian to subscribe to the journal so that your work gets maximum exposure among your colleagues, researchers and readers in the field. Bentham also has a special limited time offer in this connection: If your Librarian decides to subscribe to this journal, you will be eligible to an optional offer which will allow free Open Access to this article.

We are eager to share with you all the research articles published in Bentham Science journals that are relevant to your field of interest. For future article alerts, we request you to provide keywords and fields of your choice. Please e-mail your selections for future article alerts to Mr. F. Haq, Manager Marketing: faizan@benthamscience.net.

Bentham Science strives to promote your article to a huge audience relevant to your research, using a variety of Marketing tools and platforms. For a detailed view of all the promotional activities please visit the author's benefits section on our website.

We shall be most grateful if you could kindly distribute the journal flyer at the next few conferences that you attend. Please download the flyer at

We wish to thank you for submission of the manuscript to Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia and look forward to continued collaboration in future.

With warm regards,

Ambreen Irshad
Senior Editor
Bentham Science Publishers
ambreenirshad@benthamscience.net

Note: For complaints contact: complaint@benthamscience.net

Maximize your Visibility Though Kudos:

Bentham Science Publishers has collaborated with Kudos to increase the portfolio of its services for Bentham authors. Kudos (www.growkudos.com) is a web-based service that helps researchers to maximize the visibility, usage and citations for published articles. We will provide your article title, its online link (DOI) and your contact information to Kudos. Kudos will contact you to register and use this new service, that they are offering to a selected group of authors to help increase the readership and citations of their articles.

Increase Article Readership Through Open Access Plus:

You are invited publish your article as open access, free-to-download by availing the Open Access Plus offer. Through Open Access Plus, authors of accepted papers are given the option of paying an open access publication charge to make their paper freely available online immediately via the journal website, meaning that readers will not need a journal subscription to view open access content. Publishing open access will likely lead to more citations and readers. Open access plus articles will be clearly indicated on the journal's online contents page. In case you are interested in publishing your article as open access, please email to marketing@benthamscience.net.

Publicize your article in Recent Trends:

Bentham Science has introduced a new section, Recent Trends, on its website. In this section we can publish a press release against a small fee highlighting your article and the research enclosed. Along with the Recent Trends section , the press release will also be stated at various popular science news websites to enhance the visibility, and opportunities for citation and usage of your work. The Recent Trends press release will be published free of charge for the Editors-in-Chief and Editorial Board Members of the journal.

Free Journal Trial for your Library:

We also offer your institutions/library a FREE three months on-line trial of all Bentham Science Journals at no obligation to subscribe thereafter. The journals trial would allow free access to all the members of your institution/Library. For an on-line trial request, please visit the Online Trial Request form on our website. If you are interested in this special limited time offer then you or your Librarian may contact either the Subscription Department directly at Bentham Science or alternatively orders may be placed via your librarian's journal acquisition agency.

- **Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc** <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

3 June 2019 at 11:47

To: Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia <nna@benthamscience.net>, ambreenirshad@benthamscience.net

Dear Editor of Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia,
Ambreen Irshad (Senior Editor),

Thank you for the E-mail. We are very pleased and happy that our manuscript is accepted for publication in the Journal of Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia. We would like to thank and appreciate the Editor for managing our manuscript throughout the process.

We would like to inquire what volume our manuscript will be published in?

Thank you very much in advance for the information.

Best regards,
Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, PhD
Physics Education Department
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta

[Quoted text hidden]

Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA <nna@benthamscience.net>
To: "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

3 June 2019 at 12:08

Dear Dr. Dwandaru,

This is to inform you that your manuscript has been line up in the upcoming issues of the journal. We'll soon update the Volume and issue no of your manuscript.

Thank you very much for your cooperation in this regard

Thanks & regards,

Rukhshanda Rehman

Assistant Manager Publications

Note:

Please reply to this email at nna@benthamscience.net otherwise your email will not reach me

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

Untuk mendukung "Gerakan UNY Hijau", disarankan tidak mencetak email ini dan lampirannya.
(To support the "Green UNY movement", it is recommended not to print the contents of this email and its attachments)

Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
www.uny.ac.id

Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA <nna@benthamscience.net>
To: "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

13 June 2019 at 17:52

Cc: Rhyko.irawan17@gmail.com, liadesip@gmail.com, Supardi@uny.ac.id, suparno_mipa@uny.ac.id

Dear Dr. Dwandaru,

With reference to your manuscript accepted entitled "**Mixing of Graphite with X-ray Irradiated Water Towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers**" has been accepted for publication in "**Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia**". You are requested to provide the revised copyright letter of your manuscript with all the authors details which you have added in your revised manuscript and consent of all the authors so that we could proceed further.

Your urgent response will be highly appreciated.

Thanks & regards,

Rukhshanda Rehman

Assistant Manager Publications

Note:

Please reply to this email at nna@benthamscience.net otherwise your email will not reach me

On Mon, Jun 3, 2019 at 9:47 AM - Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id> wrote:

[Quoted text hidden]
[Quoted text hidden]

 **NNA-Copyright Letter.pdf**
108K

- **Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc** <wipsarian@uny.ac.id> 14 June 2019 at 10:41
To: Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA <nna@benthamsience.net>, "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc"
<wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Dear Editor of Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA
[Rukhshanda Rehman](#)
Assistant Manager Publications

Thank you very much for your email. We have revised the copyright letter as requested. The document is enclosed in this email.

Best Regards,
[Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, PhD](#)
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta

[Quoted text hidden]

- **Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc** <wipsarian@uny.ac.id> 14 June 2019 at 10:57
To: Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA <nna@benthamsience.net>, "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc"
<wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Dear Editor of Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA
[Rukhshanda Rehman](#)
Assistant Manager Publications

(Thank you very much for your email. We have revised the copyright letter as requested. The document is enclosed in this email.)

My apology for forgetting to attach the document. It is attached herewith.

Best Regards,
[Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, PhD](#)
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta

On Thu, 13 Jun 2019 at 17:53, Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA <nna@benthamsience.net> wrote:
[Quoted text hidden]

 **copyright letter NNA Brams.pdf**
404K

Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA <nna@benthamsience.net> 14 June 2019 at 19:04
To: "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Dear Dr. [Dwandaru](#),

Thank you very much for your response.

Thanks & regards,

[Rukhshanda Rehman](#)
Assistant Manager Publications

Note:

Please reply to this email at nna@benthamscience.net otherwise your email will not reach me

[Quoted text hidden]

Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia NNA <nna@benthamscience.net>
To: "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

14 May 2020 at 11:32

Dear Dr. Dwandaru,

With reference to your manuscript, You are requested to provide the following statements so that we could finalize the manuscript for publication.

- Grant no from the Funding agencies (if any)
- Copyright letter with all authors details in attached format
- The statement related to the data you have used in your manuscript from any of the data source, which should be presented in the following format under a separate section “**Availability of Data and Materials**” in the manuscript:

"The data supporting the findings of the article is available in the [repository name] at [URL], reference number [reference number]".

Your urgent response will be highly appreciated.

Thanks & regards,

Rukhshanda Rehman

Assistant Manager Publications

Note:

Please reply to this email at nna@benthamscience.net otherwise your email will not reach me

An interesting new journal entitled "Coronaviruses" is being launched by Bentham Science under the Editorship of Prof. Di Liu, Wuhan Institute of Virology, China, with Prof. Ferid Murad (Nobel Laureate, Stanford, USA) & Prof. Atta-ur-Rahman, FRS, (UNESCO Science Laureate) as the Senior Honorary Advisors. For further information please visit Journal [Coronaviruses](#)

[Quoted text hidden]



Copyright Letter-NNA.pdf
111K

Finalize Manuscript for Publication (BMS-NNA-2019-2 Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru)

1 message

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

15 May 2020 at 11:08

To: Nanoscience & Nanotechnology-Asia <nna@benthamsience.net>, "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Reference No.: **BMS-NNA-2019-2**

Manuscript Title: **Mixing of Graphite with X-ray Irradiated Water Towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers**

Dear Rukhshanda Rehman
Assistant Manager Publications

First of all, we are delighted that our manuscript will finally be published in Nanoscience and Nanotechnology Asia. Hence, we would like to thank the Editors and the Publication team for their efforts in making this possible.

We also have revised the manuscript as requested:

1. We have added the grant number in the **Funding** section of the revised manuscript.
2. We have completed the copyright letter with all authors details in the attached format.
3. We have completed the **Availability of Data and Materials** section of the revised manuscript.

The revised manuscript and the copyright letter are attached herewith.

Best regards,
Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, PhD
Physics Education Department
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta

2 attachments



Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru NNA final.docx
583K



Copyright Letter-NNA-Dwandaru.pdf
657K

Dear Editor of Nanoscience and Nanotechnology-Asia,

We would like to thank the editor of Nanoscience and Nanotechnology-Asia for considering our manuscript entitled: 'Mixing of Graphite with X-ray Irradiated Water Towards the Exfoliation of Graphene Layers'. We also would like to give our appreciation for the reviewers for providing their precious time in reviewing our aforementioned manuscript. Hence, we would like to give our responses to the comments by the reviewers.

1. Reviewer A

Comment 1:

In general, the results of this paper are relatively soundness to be published in a journal that focuses on nanoscience but the manuscript suffers from serious ambiguous results.

Response:

Thank you very much for your positive assessment of our manuscript. We have revised the manuscript and hopefully our revised manuscript may rectify the ambiguous results.

Comment 2:

The change (or not) on the composition of water after irradiation is not reported or discussed. Authors should clarify that what happened after irradiation of X-ray which water can oxidize graphite.

Response:

Thank you very much for the comment. We acknowledge that the change in the composition of the water after irradiation is not discussed in detail. However, we have hinted that radiolysis occurs when the distilled water is irradiated with X-ray given in by the absorption of the X-ray radiation by the distilled water in table in Fig. 4. Furthermore, we have added preliminary UV-Vis results of distilled water before and after being irradiated by X-ray, which is given in Fig. 5. A brief description is given in yellow coloured sentences in page 4.

Comment 3:

The authors should explain how the water turns into an oxidizing agent by radiation

Response:

As explained in the Introduction part, the X-ray irradiation towards the distilled water triggers water radiolysis that produces hydrogen peroxide (H_2O_2) as an oxidizing agent. This is explained in the Discussion part in page 6 in the paragraph above the reaction (1).

Comment 4:

Results of the EDAX analysis show the presence of various metals such as silicon and magnesium. Why?

Response:

Thank you very much for the comment. The presence of these metals may be caused by the preparation of the sample for the SEM characterisation. In this case we put the sample on glass slides (which should contain silicon) and then heated in an oven. Thus, some amount of silicon may also be present in the sample. Furthermore, other metals may also be a part of the components of the carbon rods in the ZnC batteries. This explanation has been given in the manuscript in page 6 in the green coloured sentences.

Comment 5:

FT-IR contains CN bond. Why? How did nitrogen enter the structure?

Response:

Thank you very much for the sharp observation. We have incorrectly characterized the CN bond. Hence, we have deleted all of the discussion concerning the CN bond in the revised manuscript.

Comment 6:

The production process for the graphene oxide nanoparticles is uncertain?

Response:

As far as the production process is concerned, the GO nanoparticles are certainly formed, which is confirmed by all of the characterization techniques, i.e.: UV-Vis, FTIR, SEM, and TEM. A firm step-by-step procedure in the production process of the GO based on water radiolysis may not yet be established in this study. In this case, we would like to at least confirm the possibility of exploring water radiolysis to produce GO. We have added this at the end of the Conclusions part in yellow coloured sentences.

Comment 7:

SEM does not show layers. TEM is mandatory.

Response:

Yes, we agree with the comment by the reviewer. Indeed the SEM images do not show layers. That is why we refer the material as ‘smooth-quadrilateral lump of clays’. We have also provided TEM image as requested by the reviewer in Fig. 10. The TEM image clearly shows few-layers of GO material and further supported by the diffraction result. A brief description of the TEM results is given in the Discussion part in page 6 in yellow-coloured sentences (below the green-coloured sentences).

2. Reviewer B**Comment 1:**

X-ray diffraction of the product should be added.

Response:

We appreciate the comment by the reviewer. Unfortunately the XRD in our University is in the maintenance stage and may not be used for some time.

Hence, we are not able to provide the XRD of the GO. However, we have added the diffraction pattern from TEM image in Fig. 10 in the revised manuscript confirming the hexagonal structure of the GO. Hopefully this suffices to show the presence of the GO material.

Comment 2:

TEM image of AFM images should be added.

Response:

We have provided the TEM image including the diffraction pattern as requested by the reviewer. The TEM image clearly shows few-layers of GO material and further supported by the diffraction result. A brief description of the TEM results is given in the Discussion part in page 6 in yellow-coloured sentences (below the green-coloured sentences).

Comment 3:

The language is poor and should be rewritten.

Response:

Thank you very much for the constructive comment. We have revised the language throughout the manuscript.

Comment 4:

Infrared spectra should be revised. I don't think that there are peak for CN, peak near to 1500 cm^{-1} refers to CO.

Response:

Thank you very much for the sharp observation. We agree with the reviewer. Hence, we have deleted the discussion concerning the CN and revised the band near 1500 cm^{-1} as CO. This is given in Fig. 7.